electronics
watch

Responsible public procurement
Rights of electronics workers.

Annual Report: 2019
MESSAGE FROM THE PRESIDENT AND DIRECTOR

MONITORING

TOOLS & RESOURCES FOR AFFILIATES

IMPACT

PROJECTS

ONLINE COMMUNITY

ORGANISATIONAL AND FINANCIAL DEVELOPMENT

Electronics Watch
Sarphatistraat 30 -1018 GL Amsterdam - Netherlands
Email: info@electronicswatch.org -Telephone: +44 748-0050-341
www.electronicswatch.org

No. 62721445 in the Dutch Chamber of Commerce Trade Register

This publication has been produced with the assistance of the European Union. The contents of this publication are the sole responsibility of the Make ICT Fair Project and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Union. The European Commission is also not responsible for any use that may be made of the information contained herein. The project 'Make ICT Fair - Reforming Manufacture & Minerals Supply Chains through Policy, Finance & Public Procurement' has received funding from the European Union's EuropeAid programme under grant agreement CSO-LA12017/388-226.
Dear reader,

Our world is facing a searing triple crisis of health, climate, and social inequities. Poor people globally have become more vulnerable to health and environmental hazards, while global supply routes have been disrupted and social orders upended.

How we act now will shape lives and environments for years and generations to come. The crises open possibilities for accelerating our movement to a future where sustainability, not growth, is our guiding light, and resilient global supply chains rest on a firm foundation of worker rights and environmental protections.

Electronics Watch is committed to do our part to realise this future. We work towards a world where public procurement drives better conditions for workers in global supply chains, and workers themselves engage in meaningful dialogue with employers and buyers to create work with dignity.

In 2019 Electronics Watch along with our affiliates (public buyers) and monitoring partners helped bring workers out of debt bondage and forced labour, created safer and healthier workplaces, and supported workers’ legal right to permanent rather than precarious employment. Together, we helped to open up the electronics industry to independent inspections and improvements. We have continued to refine our model for change, where public procurement demand is informed by worker-driven monitoring and drives engagement with companies.

You can view our accomplishments last year in this more visual Annual Report. If you are new to Electronics Watch, we invite you to get in touch to learn more and to join us in our drive towards a sustainable future.

Sheung So, President, Board of Trustees

Björn Skorpen Claeson, Director
MONITORING

Documented and responded to worker rights complaints in 9 factories.

Conducted 1 regional risk assessment (Vietnam).

Screened risks in 56 factories.

Conducted 1 supply chain screening of two major OEMs, covering 38 suppliers.

Conducted 8 full compliance investigations.
**TOOLS & RESOURCES FOR AFFILIATES**

**Updated Electronics Watch Contract Conditions**

Released version 2 of the Electronics Watch Contract Conditions for the **UK** legal framework and transposed the Contract Conditions to the national legal frameworks for **Spain**, **Belgium** (in Dutch), and **Germany**, and initiated transposition for Australia.

**Affiliate Action Guide**

The **Affiliate Action Guide** (affiliates only) summarised Electronics Watch compliance findings and recommended affiliate actions for 15 factory cases.

Electronics Watch engaged 11 brands on those cases.

**“Electronics Link” Supply Chain Database**

contained **1248 procurements from 36 affiliates, linked to 155 factories** (currently for staff use only).
Company Performance Tracker

The Company Performance Tracker evaluates, scores and tracks companies’ performance of their contractual obligations to protect the rights of workers in electronics supply chains. Electronics Watch received valued input from a range of stakeholders, including public buyers and companies.

Tools & Resources for Affiliates

Additions to Public Buyer Toolkit

- Instructional video (affiliates only)
- Guidance for Remediation and Prevention of Migrant Worker Recruitment Fees and Related Costs in Public Procurement
- Transparency and Data Use Guidance (affiliates only)
- Compliance Process description

Company Performance Tracker

Webinars

Electronics Watch organised 5 webinars:

- Migrant Worker Recruitment in Malaysia
- Worker Voices in Public Procurement
- Regional Risk Assessment of the Electronics Industry in Vietnam
- Public Buyer Toolkit
- Documenting Grievances through Workers’ Social Media Posts (affiliates only)
IMPACT

Public Buyer Demand

**14 brands identified** at least some factories that make the products affiliates buy.

**155 factories are part of our supply chain database**, Electronics Link, because they make products affiliates buy.

**42 factories were disclosed as production locations for 60 specific product models.** Out of these factories 10 were disclosed as component suppliers for specific product models.

**6 brands** reported their own compliance findings to Electronics Watch in response to our reports.
Improving working conditions

10 factories improved conditions, verified by Electronics Watch

8 brands engaged to improve conditions

12,000+ migrant workers were fully compensated for excessive recruitment fees

Addressing systemic industry issues
based on analysis of workers’ priorities in China from over a million social media posts.

1 Report on systemic issues
(affiliates only)
Improving Working Conditions

**Cal-Comp Thailand**

Having discovered excessive recruitment fees and debt bondage amongst migrant workers at Cal-Comp Thailand (supplier of printers, external hard disk drives and other computer peripherals), Electronics Watch and monitoring partner Migrant Worker Rights Network (MWRN) engaged buyers and the Responsible Business Alliance (RBA) and proposed a remedy for Cal-Comp workers. This case and others like it also helped inform our Guidance for Remediation and Prevention of Migrant Worker Recruitment Fees and Related Costs in Public Procurement.

Improvements following the Electronics Watch and MWRN investigation and company engagement include:

- **Migrant workers employed by Cal-Comp hold their own passports and work permits.**
- **Cal-Comp fully reimbursed 10,570 workers in the largest single company settlement of migrant worker recruitment fees ever.**
- **Cal-Comp stopped hiring migrant workers until they have developed an ethical recruitment policy to ensure no worker pays for their job at the factory.**

This case shows how the Electronics Watch model of worker-driven monitoring and ongoing industry engagement, supported by affiliates’ communication with their suppliers, is central to detecting and remediating violations.
Electronics Watch found 30 migrant workers in forced labour at Possehl Electronics, a semiconductor supplier in Malaysia, hired through an outsourcing agent. They had suffered delayed wage payments, illegal wage deductions and excessive overtime and faced violent threats from the outsourcing agent when they asked for their wages. Despite risking reprisal from both the agent and state authorities, the workers organized and collected the data to be able to demand remediation.

Improvements following the Electronics Watch investigation and company engagement include:

- **Workers received reimbursements for illegal wage deductions.**
- **Workers received back-wages.**
- **The outsourcing agent no longer supplies workers to Possehl.**

However, there is still a long way to go for these workers and for hundreds of thousands of migrant workers in Malaysia at risk of forced labour. Most importantly, workers themselves should have a seat at the table to define remediation in forced labour cases, including the amounts of monetary compensation and non-financial remedies. This would be an important step to ensuring they are neither marginalized nor forced labour.
Improving Working Conditions

Workers No Longer Have to Tolerate Toluene

After workers at an electronics subcontractor in Indonesia reported to Electronics Watch monitoring partner, Sedane Labour Resource Centre (LIPS), that they suffered respiratory illnesses and often fainted because of exposure to the toxic cleaning solvent, toluene, Electronics Watch brought a complaint to the main buyer. The buyer reacted quickly to improve the health and safety conditions and conducted follow-up air quality measurements which it shared with Electronics Watch.

Improvements following the Electronics Watch investigation and company engagement include:

- **Toluene was replaced with ethyl acetate, a less toxic alternative.**
- **The ventilation system was repaired.**
- **Workers received more effective protective equipment.**

While workers’ physical environment is now healthier and safer, they are not as safe as they should be until they can report problems directly to management without fear of reprisals and help to develop solutions. Unfortunately, this is not yet the case. Workers are concerned about other toxic chemicals in the factory, and LIPS and Electronics Watch are continuing monitoring.
Silent and pliable workers are an integral part of an organisation of production built on a model of cyclical orders where workers absorb the cost. Whether employers use coercion to enforce productivity requirements and low wages or flexible employment schemes to create the ability to recruit or downsize according to production, workers stay silent under threat of disciplinary action or job loss.

Electronics Watch welcomes growing industry attention to the need for workers to have a voice. However, ending the systematic silencing of workers requires more than brief auditor visits or new mobile applications that promise to transmit workers’ concerns, unilaterally, to companies. When workers have a voice they can engage in meaningful dialogue with employers and buyers to call attention to problems, contribute to solutions, and help improve working conditions. Creating opportunities for this dialogue may require a fundamental reconceptualization of the organisation of production: imagining and realising ways to achieve flexible output based on meaningful work and without coercing workers or employing flexible modes of employment that rob workers of their security.

The tenet that workers themselves are the best monitors of their working conditions is fundamental to Electronics Watch. Workers know the reality of their daily conditions and can, for example, describe effects of chemicals they handle and the impact of production targets they must meet, and recount exactly how much they have paid to recruiters to get a job in a foreign country.

However, people who suffer abuse in relations of unequal power are far more likely to stay silent than speak about their experiences. The same holds true for workers in abusive situations, especially in the absence of legally protected unions. Whether the injustice is relatively less.

Strengthening worker voices

3 trainings on worker-driven monitoring: in Indonesia, Vietnam, and the Czech Republic

Worker Voices Policy Brief

Electronics Watch Policy Brief

Worker Voices: From Talk to Action

Silent and pliable workers are an integral part of an organisation of production built on a model of cyclical orders where workers absorb the cost. Whether employers use coercion to enforce productivity requirements and low wages or flexible employment schemes to create the ability to recruit or downsize according to production, workers stay silent under threat of disciplinary action or job loss.

Electronics Watch welcomes growing industry attention to the need for workers to have a voice. However, ending the systematic silencing of workers requires more than brief auditor visits or new mobile applications that promise to transmit workers’ concerns, unilaterally, to companies. When workers have a voice they can engage in meaningful dialogue with employers and buyers to call attention to problems, contribute to solutions, and help improve working conditions. Creating opportunities for this dialogue may require a fundamental reconceptualization of the organisation of production: imagining and realising ways to achieve flexible output based on meaningful work and without coercing workers or employing flexible modes of employment that rob workers of their security.

The tenet that workers themselves are the best monitors of their working conditions is fundamental to Electronics Watch. Workers know the reality of their daily conditions and can, for example, describe effects of chemicals they handle and the impact of production targets they must meet, and recount exactly how much they have paid to recruiters to get a job in a foreign country.

However, people who suffer abuse in relations of unequal power are far more likely to stay silent than speak about their experiences. The same holds true for workers in abusive situations, especially in the absence of legally protected unions. Whether the injustice is relatively less.
Electronics Watch documented, reported, and took action on Worker Complaints:
(affiliates only)
- 5 from Malaysia
- 2 from India
- 1 from Indonesia
- 1 from Thailand

Strengthening worker voices
Make ICT Fair: 2017-2020, funded by European Union’s EuropeAid programme

- Build up of expertise and partner network on human rights issues in the mining sector
- Development of training resources on the monitoring methodology (with SOMO) and regional trainings for monitoring partners
- Cooperation with ICLEI on Procura+ Interest Group for public buyers
- Update and transpositions of Contract Conditions
- Participation of 15 civil society organisations representing or advocating for workers from the regions of electronics production in the Annual Conference and Affiliates’ and Monitoring Partners’ Meeting 2019.
- Development of affiliate tools including Public Buyer Toolkit and Supply Chain Database
- Legal research (with WEED) on mining issues in public sector supply chains of ICT equipment. Recommendations for appropriate and effective tender tools.
Monitoring of Mining Operations in the Philippines - A Pilot, Funded by Bread for All

Monitoring of two nickel mining and refinery operations.

Monitoring Partner: Pacific Asia Resource Center (PARC)

Monitoring in Surigao Norte and Palawan, Philippines

Issues found:
- Labour: not enough personal protective equipment, straining shift work, extreme overtime, agency work and precarious employment
- Environment: Loss of surface vegetation and topsoil in vast areas, cancer-causing hexavalent chromium found in local water streams

Evidence obtained by monitoring work
- 58 hours of overtime in two weeks
- well above the “Karo-shi Line” (Death by Overwork Standard)

Open pit mining exposes toxic minerals
- Due to the topsoil and vegetation being removed, toxic minerals flow out when it rains.
- “Cr(VI) (hexavalent chromium) is known to cause cancer. In addition, it targets the respiratory system, kidneys, liver, skin and eyes.” US Department of Labor OSHA.
**EVENTS**

**Electronics Watch Annual Conference and Affiliates and Monitoring Partners Meeting 2019**

- **100 participants** from **22 countries**, including **51 public buyers** joined the fourth Electronics Watch Annual Conference in Barcelona.

- **15 plenary presentations across 5 panels, and 3 technical workshops**.
- Topics of presentations included manufacturing and mining, climate and human rights emergency, remediation of modern slavery, health and safety in the electronics industry, supply chain transparency, public procurement and responsible business conduct.
- For the first time there was language interpretation, and streaming for people who chose not to travel.

Throughout the year Electronics Watch also participated in 23 events organised by other organisations around the world, including the UN Forum on Business and Human Rights in Geneva, the Launch Event for the Human Rights Defenders Network in the Philippines, the Ethical Public Procurement Conference in London and the IT Beschaffungskonferenz 2019 in Bern.
**ONLINE COMMUNITY**

The Electronics Watch Website

16,000 visitors

Affiliates’ Intranet (affiliates only)

410 users  8 affiliate updates sent

**Social Media**

2588 visits to the Electronics Watch twitter profile

Work began collating videos from monitoring partners and other stakeholders, to launch the Electronics Watch Youtube channel in early 2020.
ORGANISATIONAL AND FINANCIAL DEVELOPMENT

329 Total number of Electronics Watch affiliates

- 100+
- 50 - 100
- 20 - 50
- 10 - 20
- 2 - 10
- 1

Affiliates

Monitoring
ORGANISATIONAL AND FINANCIAL DEVELOPMENT

Affiliates

AFILIATES (as at 31 December, 2019)
Amsterdam City Council, Netherlands
Barcelona City Council*, Spain
Dutch Ministry of Education, Culture and Science*, Netherlands
Durham University*, United Kingdom
Ethical Culture Fieldston School*, United States of America
Haarlem City Council, Netherlands
Hanse University of Applied Sciences*, Netherlands
Kingston University*, United Kingdom
Lewisham Council, United Kingdom
London South Bank University*, United Kingdom
Loughborough University, United Kingdom
Manchester Metropolitan University, United Kingdom
Metropolitan Transport for Barcelona, Spain
Nottingham Trent University, United Kingdom
Sant Boi City Council*, Spain
Southern Universities Purchasing Consortium, United Kingdom
State of Vaud*, Switzerland
Stockholm County Council*, Sweden
SKL Kommentus, Sweden
Swansea University*, United Kingdom
The University of Edinburgh*, United Kingdom
The University of Sheffield, United Kingdom
Tower Hamlets London Borough Council*, United Kingdom
Transport for London*, United Kingdom
UNISON, United Kingdom
University of Aberdeen*, United Kingdom
University of Groningen, Netherlands
University of Leeds*, United Kingdom
University of Leicester*, United Kingdom
University Medical Centre Utrecht (UMC-Utrecht)*, Netherlands
University of Reading, United Kingdom
University of Sussex, United Kingdom
University of Westminster*, United Kingdom
University of Winchester, United Kingdom
Utrecht City Council*, Netherlands
Zurich University of the Arts, Switzerland

CONSORTIUM AFFILIATES
(click on links to see members)
Advanced Procurement for Universities & Colleges*, United Kingdom
Catalan Association of Municipalities, Spain
Catalan Government*, Spain
Greater London Authority, United Kingdom
ITSH-edu*, Germany
London Universities Purchasing Consortium*, United Kingdom
North Western Universities Purchasing Consortium (NWUPC), United Kingdom
Swedish Regions, Sweden
Romandy Computer Purchasing Partnership, Switzerland

Monitoring Partners

Center for Development and Integration (CDI), Vietnam
Center for Trade Union and Human Rights (CTUHR), Philippines
Centre for Social Issues (SPOT), Czechia
Centro de Reflexión y Acción Laboral (CERAL), Mexico
Civil Initiatives for Development and Peace (CIVIDEP), India
Coalición de Extrabajadoras y trabajadoras de la industria Electrónica Nacional (CETIEN), Mexico
Economic Rights Institute (ERI), Hong Kong
Globalworks, Sweden

Labour Education and Service Network (LESN), Hong Kong
Migrant Worker Rights Network (MWRN), Thailand
Pacific Asia Resource Centre (PARC), Japan
Polish Institute for Human Rights and Business (PIHRB), Poland
Sedane Labour Resource Center (LIPS), Indonesia
Tenaganita, Malaysia
Worker Empowerment (WE), China
Workers Assistance Center (WAC), Philippines

* Founding members
Board of Trustees

Sheung So, Labour Education and Service Network (LESN), China (Hong Kong) – Chair,

Michael Gibson Kilner, London Universities Purchasing Consortium (LUPC), UK – Treasurer

Pauline Overeem, SOMO, Netherlands - Secretary

Daisy Arago, Center for Trade Union & Human Rights (CTUHR), Philippines

Jim Cranshaw, Strategic consultant, UK

Emma Fletcher, Advanced Purchasing for Universities and Colleges, UK

David Foust, Labour rights expert, Mexico

Pauline Göthberg, Region Stockholm, Sweden (replaced by Kathleen McCaughey in November)

Huib de Langen, University of Groningen, Netherlands

Olga Martin-Ortega, University of Greenwich, UK

Sanjiv Pandita, Asian Network for the Rights of Occupational and Environmental Victims (ANROEV), Hong Kong

Gopinathan Parakuni, Civil Initiatives for Development and Peace (CIVIDEP), India -
Welcome Omana!

Omana George joined the Electronics Watch staff at the end of 2019 as our new Monitoring Coordinator. Omana has been an organizer and promoter of occupational health and safety in Asia with 17 years of regional experience in the area of labour rights. She worked with the Asia Monitor Resource Centre (AMRC) based in Hong Kong, and has played an essential role in building and supporting the Asian Network for the Rights of Occupational and Environmental Victims (ANROEV), a network of grassroots organizations in more than 20 countries and territories in Asia. She has carried out trainings and other OSH initiatives in Indonesia, Malaysia, Vietnam, Philippines, India, Mexico and Nepal with trade unions and worker organizations in the electronics industry and in other sectors like garments and construction. Omana was recently awarded the Rachel Lee Jung-Lim Award in memory of the life of this campaigner for a global asbestos ban. She holds a Master’s degree from the University of Madras.

Electronics Watch Country Representatives

France - Brigitte Demeure; Spain - Laia Fargas; Netherlands – Eelco Fortuijn; UK - Harpreet Paul; Australia - Julie Petticrew

Advisory Group

Block 1 – Public Sector Buyers
(329 organisations)

Block 2 – Experts in human rights, labour rights, occupational health & safety and global supply chains
(19 organisations, 15 individuals)

Block 3 – Civil society organisations from the regions of electronics production representing or advocating for workers
(26 organisations)
Total Income

The net income for 2019 was **€ 1,187**

Sources of Income 2019

- **Earned Income*/In-kind income**: 3%
- **Affiliation fee**: 69%
- **EC Funds**: 25%
- **Foundations & organisations**: 3%

**Monitoring & Remediation** - Monitoring partners, staff, training events, and travel

**Outreach & Affiliate Services** - Country representatives, staff, annual conference and events, materials design, legal consultations, development of supply chain database and procurement tools

**Operations** - Administration, accountancy, audit, insurance, rent, communication and other infrastructure

Distribution of Expenditure

**Monitoring & Remediation**

**Outreach & Affiliates Services**

**Operations**